

KINA[I]JDOS: A PUN IN DEMOSTHENES' *ON THE CROWN*?

In his speech *On the Crown* (330 B.C.E.), the orator Demosthenes twice refers to his opponent Aeschines as a *kinados* ('fox'), both times in the context of accusing him of flattery and slandering in the service of Philip of Macedon (18.162, 242). Although a number of scholars have studied the use of invective in the speeches of Demosthenes and Aeschines,¹ very little attention has been paid to the significance of this peculiar epithet.² In this note, I investigate why Demosthenes calls Aeschines a *kinados*, suggesting that, in addition to painting Aeschines as devious, the word may also have served as a pun.

According to lexicographers and scholiasts, *kinados* was the Sicilian word for fox,³ as well as being a synonym for *thêrion* ('wild animal'), since wild animals move (*kinein*) a lot.⁴ Used metaphorically, it could connote the perceived attributes of the fox, namely shrewdness and deceitfulness.⁵ So, for example, the Hoopoe in Aristophanes' *Birds* describes Pisthetaerus, the Athenian visiting Cloudcuckooland, as 'the craftiest of foxes' (πυκνότεατον κίναδος; Ar. Av. 430). In the *Clouds*, the foolish Strepsiades rattles off a long list of things he'd like to be called after his training in sophistry, including *kinados* (Ar. Nub. 448). And Ajax, in Sophocles' play of the same name, alludes to his enemy Odysseus as a 'damned fox' (ἐπίτριπτον κίναδος; Soph. Aj. 103).⁶

Bolstering his portrayal of Aeschines as a sneaky scoundrel, Demosthenes clearly uses *kinados* in a similar way. But I think it's worth asking why Demosthenes chooses this particular word, rather than one of many other Greek words for 'cunning'. One

¹ See e.g. I. Bruns, *Das literarische porträt der Griechen im fünften und vierten jahrhundert vor Christi geburt* (Berlin, 1896), 570–85; G.D. Rowe, 'The portrait of Aeschines in the Oration on the Crown', *TAPhA* 97 (1966), 397–406; E.M. Burke, 'Character denigration in the Attic orators, with particular reference to Demosthenes and Aeschines' (Diss., Tufts University, 1972), chs. 4–7; A.R. Dyck, 'The function and persuasive power of Demosthenes' portrait of Aeschines in the speech On the Crown', *G&R* 32 (1985), 42–8; P. Easterling, 'Actors and voices: reading between the lines in Aeschines and Demosthenes', in S. Goldhill and R. Osborne (edd.), *Performance Culture and Athenian Democracy* (Cambridge, 1999), 154–66; N. Worman, 'Insult and oral excess in the disputes between Aeschines and Demosthenes', *AJPh* 125 (2004), 1–25 and *Abusive Mouths in Classical Athens* (Cambridge, 2008), ch. 5; V. Muñoz Llamosas, 'Insultos e invectiva entre Demóstenes y Esquines', *Minerva* 21 (2008), 33–49; D. Kamen, 'Servile invective in Classical Athens', *SCI* 28 (2009), 43–56.

² But see H. Yunis, *Demosthenes On the Crown* (Cambridge, 2001), on 18.162, who points out the irony in describing Aeschines as a (smart) fox, since a few words later he is described as unperceptive (οὐκ αἰσθάνει); and Muñoz Llamosas, (n. 1), 40, who notes the use of *kinados*, here and elsewhere in Greek literature, to refer to misused cunning.

³ Fox: *Etym. Magn.*, Harp., Phot., *Suda* s.v. κίναδος; Σ Ar. Nub. 448, Theoc. 5.25.

⁴ Wild animal: *Etym. Magn.*, Harp., Hsch., Phot., *Suda*, Zonar. s.v. κίναδος; Σ Ar. Nub. 448, Theoc. 5.25. The second hand on a codex of Dem. 18 (F²) glosses the κίναδος in 162 as θηρίον.

⁵ On these attributes of foxes, see e.g. Arist. *Hist. an.* 488b20: Καὶ τὰ μὲν πανοῦργα καὶ κακοῦργα, οἷον ὀλώπηξ ('And some [animals] are deceitful and evildoing, like the fox'). On *kinados* used of evildoers and deceitful people, see *Etym. Magn.* and *Suda* s.v. κίναδος; Σ Ar. Nub. 448, Theoc. 5.25. The more common Greek term for 'fox', ὀλώπηξ, could be used in a similar way, although it appears in our sources less commonly (see e.g. Ar. *Lys.* 1133). See further C.M. Bowra, 'The fox and the hedgehog', *CQ* 34 (1940), 26–9 on the fox (and hedgehog) in classical literature; cf. P. Wackers, 'The image of the fox in Middle Dutch literature', in B.J. Levy and P. Wackers (edd.), *The Fox and Other Animals* (Amsterdam, 1993), 181–98.

⁶ There are many more examples: e.g. in Menander's *Epitrepontes*, a greedy old man named Smicrines is referred to as a *kinados* (Men. *Epit.* 165); and a shepherd in Theocritus addresses his rival shepherd, a suspected thief, as *kinados* (Theoc. *Id.* 5.25). See also Andoc. 1.99, Aeschin. 3.167, Din. 1.40.

motivating factor might be the fact that *kinados* calls to mind animal imagery, perhaps to particular rhetorical effect. Many years ago, Galen Rowe pointed out the pervasive animal language in *On the Crown*, arguing that its evocation of the comic stage was part of a broader strategy of painting Aeschines as a comic braggart figure, the *alazôn*.⁷ If we accept this plausible (if rather fanciful) interpretation, it might shed some light on Demosthenes' word choice.

More relevant, I think, are two other factors: 1) the fact that Aeschines had just addressed Demosthenes as *kinados* in *Against Ctesiphon* (3.167), the speech to which Demosthenes' *On the Crown* responds (a point to which I will return); and especially 2) *kinados*' potential for punning.⁸ In addition to meaning 'fox', the word *kinados* sounds remarkably similar to *kinaidos*, a word often translated as 'catamite' or 'passive homosexual', but which properly refers to a man characterized by a non-conformance to gender norms and an inability to control his sexual appetites – often leading to, among other things, a desire to be penetrated.⁹ The perceived similarity between these two words can be seen in the fact that later scholiasts on two codices (F², Y) gloss Demosthenes' second *kinados* (18.242) with *μαλακός, ἀνδρόγυνος* ('soft', 'hermaphrodite'), that is, common synonyms of *kinaidos*. These scholiasts either recognized (and were explaining) a pun, or they mistook *kinados* for the more common word *kinaidos*.¹⁰

The notion that *kinados* might have called to mind *kinaidos* for contemporary audiences as well is substantiated by other Attic orators' use of the same pun.¹¹ In his speech *On the Mysteries* (399 B.C.E.), Andocides quotes the line of Sophocles' *Ajax* mentioned above, addressing Epichares, a man who has informed falsely against him, as 'damned fox' (ἐπίτριπτον κινάδος; Andoc. 1.99).¹² Then, in the very next paragraph (1.100), Andocides responds to Epichares' accusation that he (Andocides) was part of an oligarchic association (ἐταιρεία) by claiming that Epichares had sexual relations (ἡταιρία) with many men.¹³ This verbal play on ἐταιρεία/ἐταιρέω, as well as the implication that Epichares was a prostitute, reinforces in turn the punning nature of the earlier *kinados*.

It is tempting to interpret Aeschines' use of *kinados* in 3.167 (mentioned above) as another pun on *kinaidos*, especially in light of the sexual invective Aeschines employs elsewhere against his opponent. In addition to frequently using *kinaidos* and *kinaidia* to describe Demosthenes (1.131, 181; 2.88, 99, 151), Aeschines repeatedly calls attention to his opponent's childhood nickname Bat(t)alos (Aeschin. 1.126, 131, 164; 2.99).¹⁴

⁷ See Rowe (n. 1).

⁸ See also Muñoz Llamosas, (n. 1), 44 n. 57, who observes that orators' insults can carry sexual connotations through puns, using *kinados/kinaidos* as an example.

⁹ On the figure of the *kinaidos*, see J.J. Winkler, *The Constraints of Desire: The Anthropology of Sex and Gender in Ancient Greece* (New York, 1990), 45–70; see also K. Ormand, *Controlling Desires: Sexuality in Ancient Greece and Rome* (Westport, CT, 2008), 19 and *passim*. James Davidson downplays the penetration element: J.N. Davidson, *Courtesans and Fishcakes: The Consuming Passions of Classical Athens* (London, 1997), 167–82 and *The Greeks and Greek Love: A Radical Reappraisal of Homosexuality in Ancient Greece* (London, 2007), 55–60.

¹⁰ Indeed, even Winkler (n. 9), 65 misquotes the text as reading *kinaidos*.

¹¹ Cf. the use of the *kinados/kinaidos* pun in Lucian, *Pseudol.* 32, as pointed out by P.G. Maxwell-Stuart, 'Three words of abusive slang in Aeschines', *AJPh* 96 (1975), 7–12, at 11.

¹² On the pun on *kinados* in Andoc. 1.99, see W.J. Hickie, *Andocides De Mysteriis* (London, 1885), ad loc.; D.M. MacDowell, *Andokides, On the Mysteries* (Oxford, 1962), ad loc.; H. Wankel, *Demosthenes, Rede für Ktesiphon über den Kranz* (Heidelberg, 1976), on Dem. 18.162.

¹³ MacDowell (n. 12), ad loc. points out Andocides' play on words here.

¹⁴ For discussion of the multiple meanings of this nickname, see K.J. Dover, *Greek Homosexuality* (Cambridge, MA, 1978), 75; J. Henderson, *The Maculate Muse* (New York and Oxford, 1991), 203; Yunis (n. 2), on 18.180; N. Fisher, *Aeschines, Against Timarchos* (Oxford, 2001) on Aeschin. 1.131;

This nickname, with two taus, could refer to Demosthenes' stammering problem,¹⁵ or, with one tau, to his effeminacy and fondness for being anally penetrated.¹⁶ The latter spelling – the one Aeschines uses – derives its meaning either from a certain effeminate *aulos*-player named Batalos¹⁷ or from a slang term for anus.¹⁸

In similar attacks, Aeschines describes Demosthenes as a 'hermaphrodite' (ἀνδρόγυνος; 2.127); as possessing 'a lack of courage or manliness' (ἀνδανδρία; 1.131; 2.139, 148; 3.155, 160, 209, 247; cf. 2.179); as 'womanly in spirit' (γυναικεῖω τὴν ὀργήν; 2.179); and as someone who 'will never do a man's work' (πράξιν δὲ ἀνδρὸς οὐ πράξεις; 3.167). Aeschines also declares that he will not deign to describe the sexual acts that a young man named Aristion of Plataea 'endured or performed' with Demosthenes (πάσχων ἢ πράττων; 3.162), nor the ways in which Demosthenes 'has (mis-)used both his own body and his procreative ability' (κέχρηται καὶ τῷ ἑαυτοῦ σώματι καὶ παιδοποιεῖ; 3.174).

Given all of Aeschines' jabs at Demosthenes for his alleged effeminacy, it is perhaps not surprising to discover that some scholiasts changed the *kinados* in Aeschin. 3.167 to *kinaidos*.¹⁹ The manuscript tradition, however, strongly suggests that Aeschines did say *kinados*. In using this double entendre, he presumably elicited laughter²⁰ both from the jurors and from the numerous bystanders in the courtroom,²¹ who were expecting yet another attack on Demosthenes' masculinity. The fact that Aeschines immediately follows this word with a description of Demosthenes whirling around on the speaker's platform (how *kinaidos*-like!) serves to bolster the pun.²²

Whether or not the *kinados* of Aeschin. 3.167 was a deliberate pun – and I imagine it was – it likely inspired Demosthenes to make use of the same ambiguous word (twice!) in his defence speech, inserting it either off-the-cuff in the courtroom or in his revision of the speech.²³ This type of 'borrowing' of tropes and language (intentionally or

H. Yunis, *Demosthenes, Speeches 18 and 19* (Austin, 2005), 76 n. 151; Worman (n. 1 [2004]), 8 and (n. 1 [2008]), 240; Ormand (n. 9), 50.

¹⁵ This is probably the sense Demosthenes has in mind when he alludes to his nickname in 18.180; see Yunis (n. 2), ad loc. On Demosthenes as a chatterer, see Worman (n. 1 [2004]) and (n. 1 [2008]), ch. 5.

¹⁶ That it refers to effeminacy: Harp. s.v. Βάταλος; Σ Aeschin. 1.126.

¹⁷ That it refers to Batalos the *auletēs*: Plut. *Dem.* 4.6; Lib. *Arg. D.* 5. For an alternate theory that Batalos was a writer of wanton verses and drinking songs, see Plut. *Dem.* 4.6.

¹⁸ For *batalos* a synonym of *prōktos* ('anus'): Σ Aeschin. 1.126; Eup. fr. 92 K.-A.; cf. Plut. *Dem.* 4.7, who says simply that it's a part of the body not decent to be named.

¹⁹ Manuscripts with the *kinados* of Aeschin. 3.167 emended to *kinaidos*: m^a, g^a. Worman (n. 1 [2004]), 16 and (n. 1 [2008]), 261 takes this passage as reading *kinaidos*.

²⁰ On laughter in the courtroom, see S. Halliwell, 'The uses of laughter in Greek culture', *CQ* 41 (1991), 279–96, at 292–4. We might compare the laughter provoked by Timarchus' and Autolyclus' (unintentional) double entendres in the Assembly (Aeschin. 1.80–4); on the meaning of these double entendres, see Fisher (n. 14), ad loc.

²¹ On the uproar caused by juries in general, see V. Bers, 'Dikastic *thorubos*', in P.A. Cartledge and F.D. Harvey (edd.), *Cruce: Essays in Greek History Presented to G.E.M. de Ste. Croix on his 75th Birthday* (London, 1985), 1–15; on the role played by bystanders in the courtroom, see A. Lanni, 'Spectator sport or serious politics? οἱ περιεστηκότες and the Athenian law courts', *JHS* 117 (1997), 183–9.

²² That such gyrations (κύκλω περιδινῶν σεαυτόν, 'whirling yourself around in a circle') were *kinaidos*-like is perhaps substantiated by a folk etymology of *kinaidos*: 'moving one's genitals' (κινεῖν τὰ αἰδοῖα; *Etym. Magn.*, Zonar. s.v. κιναιδοῦς). This description of Demosthenes may also have called to mind Aeschines' earlier portrayal (in 346 B.C.E.) of the effeminate Timarchus performing gymnastics before the Assembly (Aeschin. 1.26).

²³ See I. Worthington, 'Greek oratory, revision of speeches and the problem of historical reliability', *C&M* 42 (1991), 55–74 on the revision of forensic speeches.

otherwise) was common in Attic oratory: in fact, Dinarchus, in his own speech against Demosthenes seven years later, cribs from Aeschines' description of the man, alluding to Demosthenes and his ilk as *kinadê* (Din. 1.40).²⁴

That Demosthenes too is using this pun is suggested by the words he chooses to pair with *kinados*. Thus in 18.242, Demosthenes places the word φύσει ('by nature') immediately before *kinados*. Given contemporary debates about the 'naturalness' of *kinaidia*, many in the audience would have expected, after *phusei*, a word along the lines of *kinaidos* (cf. φύσει θηλυδρία, 'effeminate by nature'; [Arist.] *Pr.* 879b20–21); when Demosthenes says *kinados* instead, it would have been difficult not to (also) hear *kinaidos*.²⁵ In 18.162, Demosthenes addresses Aeschines directly as *kinados* (ὦ κίναδος) – admittedly straining the pun a bit more than in 242, since the vocative of *kinaidos* is *kinaide* – and immediately follows this vocative with the participle *kolakeuôn*, 'flattering' (that is, Aeschines flattered statesmen like Aristophon and Eubulus when they were alive, but denounces them now that they are dead). Because flatterers (*kolakes*) are often portrayed as effeminate and submissive in Greek literature (see e.g. Theophr. *Char.* 2), the possibility is at least raised that the preceding vocative might have been a pun on the ultimate effeminate figure, the *kinaidos*.²⁶

One appeal of *kinados* for Demosthenes, then, was that it allowed him to underscore his broader argument that Aeschines was a sneaky scoundrel, while also (surreptitiously) taunting Aeschines in the same way that Aeschines always taunted him, perhaps even implying that Aeschines was 'prostituting' himself to Philip. It is true that Demosthenes was capable of using more overt sexual (or least gendered) invective against Aeschines – e.g. calling attention to his participation in feminine religious rites with his mother as a boy (e.g. 18.260) – but it was also the case that he had little grounds on which to assert that Aeschines was actually a *kinaidos*. That is, although character denigration was acceptable in the Athenian courtroom, there were limits to what one could say in terms of credibility. By using a pun, then, Demosthenes could hint at this insult, one so often levelled against him, without saying it outright. He could always claim, after the fact, that he had called Aeschines a 'fox', not a 'fag'.²⁷

University of Washington

DEBORAH KAMEN

dkamen@uw.edu

doi:10.1017/S0009838813000827

²⁴ See also Worman (n.1 [2004]), 16 n. 49, who points out a number of other passages (1.66, 92, 95, 110) where Dinarchus echoes Aeschines' portrait of Demosthenes.

²⁵ See Winkler (n. 9), 64–70 for a discussion of ancient texts explaining the phenomenon of *kinai-
doi* by nature (φύσει or κατὰ φύσιν).

²⁶ On the effeminacy of flatterers, see Worman (n. 1 [2008]), 304–7.

²⁷ I use 'fag' here in the North American sense of 'effeminate gay man'.